

---

---

**EUROPEAN TRANSFORMATIONS  
UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA  
ROME STUDY CENTER**

**ART CRIME AND CULTURAL HERITAGE PROTECTION**

---

---

### **Course Description**

With an emphasis on Italy, this course focuses on the looting, destruction, reselling and reuse of ancient objects and monuments, from classical antiquity to today, in consideration of the question, "Who owns the past?" Together we will consider issues such as what constitutes an art/cultural heritage crime, how ideas of value (both real and symbolic) have emerged historically and how have they changed over time, what constitutes "ownership" in the eyes of different entities, and how this has changed over the past 50 years, resulting in the current difficult and controversial issue of the repatriation of cultural artifacts which have crossed international borders. Themes considered will be the history of collecting, illegal excavation and the illicit trade in antiquities, the role of auction houses, the Church, museums and galleries, ownership and patrimony issues, international laws and agreements (in particular the Hague Convention of 1954, the 1970 UNESCO Convention, and the 1995 UNIDROIT Convention), recovery and repatriation, and ongoing problems with the protection and conservation of antiquities. As a class we will debate, for example, the benefits of repatriation vs. object care and viewership, and the issue of ownership in cases in which all parties involved had, at some time, "legal" rights to the artifact(s) in question. We will end this section of the course with a review of cultural heritage laws and the current international situation, as well as a discussion identifying challenges and providing suggestions for regulating the market of antiquities in the future. The last portion of the course will focus on the way that the physical city today is the result of decisions over the years to destroy, alter, or completely preserve Rome's ancient monuments. We will closely examine the buildings and areas, and eras, in question, in an effort to understand the ways that Rome deals with, and has dealt with, its issues of cultural heritage preservation. This course will include visits to relevant sites and museums in and around Rome, and will include the close investigation of actual case studies throughout.

### **Course Goals**

Students will come away from the course with a thorough understanding of the current international situation surrounding the acquisition, ownership and repatriation of Italy's ancient objects, and the ways in which this has changed over time. In addition, students will have obtained a general knowledge of classical art and the important monuments of ancient Rome. Finally, students will also have gained an understanding of the physical city of Rome, and the ways in which her appearance today has been influenced by her ancient past.

### **Learning Objectives**

Students will consider several different types of evidence (from material culture to current legislation), which will allow and encourage them to think critically. The written and oral assignments will help improve research and communication skills.

### **Class Preparation and Participation**

Your appreciation and understanding of lectures and discussions will be greatly enhanced if you complete reading assignments by their due date, and you will be expected to come to class fully prepared and ready to actively participate. Therefore, class participation and completion of reading assignments count for 10% of your final grade.

### **Group Case Presentations**

Students will be asked to present twice during the course of the quarter; these will be group presentations. The first presentation will involve a relevant legal case involving an art crime in Italy. For this presentation, the group will research and present the general facts to the class, highlighting both sides of the debate. The second group presentation will be a monument "biography" given on-site, focusing on the monument's history, cultural heritage issues and current state. Your work for both presentations should be turned in (per group) in outline form, with a full bibliography. The two presentations are together worth 20% of your final grade.

### **Research Paper**

You will be asked to write an eight to 10-page research paper. The topic may be the case you presented in class (and you may argue either side of the debate, in your paper). Alternatively, you may discuss another case altogether, or you may write on a topic of your choice related to the issue of art crime and cultural heritage protection of antiquities as related to the country of Italy. Your topic must be approved by the professor before you begin your research. The final

version of your paper should be typed, double-spaced, with 1-inch margins, 10- or 12-point font size, a title page, and a correctly formatted, full bibliography. *Please take advantage of the Study Center library* while conducting research for your paper. The paper is worth 20% of your final grade. Copies of all papers must be submitted electronically to the professor's e-mail address and officially submitted on the Moodle for this course. Make sure, with both electronic submissions, that the file containing your paper includes your last name and part of the course title.

### Exams

There will be a midterm and a final exam. The midterm is worth 20% of your final grade, and the final exam is worth 30%. The exams will have the same format, and will include definitions, short answer, and essay questions. The final exam is cumulative. The in-class examination is individual, and no books or other study materials may be consulted while it is in progress. Once the examination starts, students will not be allowed to leave the room until they have finished their work.

### Grading

The final course grade will be determined according to the following:

Participation and Preparation: 10%

Group Case Presentation: 20%

Research Paper: 20%

Midterm Exam: 20%

Final Exam: 30%

### Attendance

All UC Rome courses operate under an attendance policy created by the UC Faculty Advisory Committee that oversees the program. According to that policy, each unexcused absence will result in a 3% point deduction from the final raw total for that class. Students who are late to class or leave early will receive an "L" on the attendance sheet. Three tardies (i.e. "L") automatically convert to an absence. It is a student's responsibility to sign-in before each class. In the case of absences, it is the student's responsibility to find out what information was given in class including handouts or any announcements made. No guests are allowed in any UC Rome course or site visit.

### Academic Honesty

All students are expected to conduct themselves according to the principles and procedures of academic integrity and are held to the standards outlined in the EAP Academic Conduct policy, available at the following URL and on the UC Rome Study Center website:

[http://eap.ucop.edu/Documents/\\_forms/1112/Policy\\_Academic\\_Conduct.pdf](http://eap.ucop.edu/Documents/_forms/1112/Policy_Academic_Conduct.pdf)

### Reading Assignments

The reading assignment for each class is listed in the syllabus on the day of that class, but should be completed *before the class meeting*. Readings are only assigned for the in-class sessions; there will be no required reading for site visits. Course readings appear in Moodle; the reading assignment for each class appears in the schedule, below.

#### Textbook for the Course:

J. Felch and R. Frammolino, *Chasing Aphrodite* (Boston: 2011)

#### Selected Further Reading:

K. Fitz Gibson (ed.), *Who Owns the Past?: Cultural Policy, Cultural Property, and the Law* (New Brunswick: 2005)

T. Hoving, *Making the Mummies Dance* (New York: 1993)

D. Karmon, *The Ruin of the Eternal City: Antiquity and Preservation in Renaissance Rome* (2011)

B. McNall, *Fun While It Lasted: My Rise and Fall in the Land of Fame and Fortune* (New York: 2003)

K. E. Meyer, *The Plundered Past* (New York: 1977)

B. W. Painter, Jr., *Mussolini's Rome: Rebuilding the Eternal City* (New York: 2005)

K. D. Vitelli and C. Colwell-Chanthaphonh, *Archaeological Ethics* (Oxford: 2006)

P. Watson, *Sotheby's: Inside Story* (London: 1998)

P. Watson & C. Todeschini, *The Medici Conspiracy* (New York: 2007)

## SCHEDULE OF CLASSES

### Week 1

#### Class Lecture

##### Introduction to the Course

##### Reading for Week One:

*Chasing Aphrodite*, Prologue and all of Part I

M. M. Miles Article, "Greek and Roman Art and the Debate About Cultural Property"

#### Class Lecture

##### Antiquities: The Love Affair

##### History of Collecting, Forgeries, Looting and the Black Market

##### Reading:

C. C. Coggins, "Archaeology and the Art Market," in K. Fitz Gibbon (ed.), *Who Owns the Past?*, pp. 221 - 230.

A. Solomon, "Art in Jeopardy" in K. Fitz Gibbon (ed.), *Who Owns the Past?*, pp. 239 - 246.

M. E. Mayo, "Collecting Ancient Art: An Historical Perspective," in K. Fitz Gibbon (ed.), *Who Owns the Past?*, pp. 133 - 142.

Article in the New York Times:

<http://www.nytimes.com/1997/12/19/arts/antiques-a-passion-for-chasing-antiquities.html>

#### Class Lecture

##### What's to Love? A Lesson on Greek Pottery and Sculpture

##### John Beazley and Attribution Studies/Connoisseurship

##### Sample Case Study: The Getty Bronze

##### Reading:

*Chasing Aphrodite*, All of Part II

J. Beazley, "Citharoedus" in *Journal of Hellenic Studies*, Vol. 42 (1922), pp. 70 - 98.

D. von Bothmer, "Notes on Collectors of Vases," in *Wealth of the Ancient World: The Nelson Bunker Hunt and William Herbert Hunt Collections* (1983), pp. 37 - 44.

##### Reading for Sample Case Study

P. Watson & C. Todeschini, *The Medici Conspiracy* (New York: 2007), pp. 82 and 99.

J. Felch and R. Frammolino, *Chasing Aphrodite* (Boston: 2011), pp. 57-73.

### Week 2

#### Class Lecture

##### The Collection of Antiquities: The Role of Museums, Auction Houses, and Private Collectors

##### Tombaroli & Italy's Looting Problem; Giacomo Medici, Genoa, and the Villa Giulia

##### Reading

A. Kozloff, "The Antiquities Market: When, What, Where, Who, Why...and How Much?" in K. Fitz Gibbon (ed.), *Who Owns the Past?*, pp. 183 - 190.

S. White, "Building American Museums: The Role of the Private Collector," in K. Fitz Gibbon (ed.), *Who Owns the Past?*, pp. 165 - 178.

P. Marks (ed.), "Dealers Speak," in K. Fitz Gibbon (ed.), *Who Owns the Past?*, pp. 191 - 200.

"My Life as a Tombarolo" article (Moodle)

RAND, Medici Case (Moodle)

##### Case Study I: Statue of Apollo Sauroktonos (Cleveland Museum of Art)

Reading for Case Study: D. W. J. Gill, "The Cleveland Apollo Goes Public," in the *Journal of Art Crime* 10, pp. 71-77.

##### Case Study II: Marble table support with griffins attacking a doe (returned from the Getty)

Reading for Case Study: <http://traffickingculture.org/encyclopedia/case-studies/j-paul-getty-museum-returns-to-italy-2007/>

## Site Visit

**Banditaccia Necropolis and Cerveteri Museum**

Meeting Point: Piazza della Repubblica, in front of Hotel Esedra, at 8:00 a.m.

## Reading:

Article on the Trial of Marion True

## Optional/Further Reading:

D. H. Lawrence, *Etruscan Places*, Chapter 1: <http://gutenberg.net.au/ebooks09/0900381h.html>

**Case Study I:** Euphronios Krater (returned to Italy from the MET)

**Reading for the Case Study:** P. Watson & C. Todeschini, *The Medici Conspiracy* (New York: 2007), Case Note: Euphronios Krater

**Case Study II:** Morgantina Statue (returned to Italy from the Getty)

**Reading for Case Study:** J. Felch and R. Frammolino, *Chasing Aphrodite* (Boston: 2011)

## Week 3

## Site Visit

**Houses Under Palazzo Valentini and Hadrian's Auditorium**

Meeting and End Point: The Column of Trajan in Piazza Venezia at 11:30 AM

## MIDTERM EXAM

## Site Visit

**Villa Giulia Museum**

Meeting Point: In front of the Villa Giulia Museum (Piazzale di Villa Giulia, 9), at 9:00 a.m.

## Reading:

*Chasing Aphrodite*, All of Part III (including Epilogue)

**Case Study I:** Euphronios Kylix (regained from Giacomo Medici for Italy)

**Reading for Case Study:** V. Silver, *The Lost Chalice* (New York: 2010), and P. Watson & C. Todeschini, *The Medici Conspiracy* (New York: 2007)

**Case Study II:** 20 Plates by the Bryn Mawr Painter (regained from Giacomo Medici for Italy)

**Reading for Case Study:** V. Silver, *The Lost Chalice* (New York: 2010), and P. Watson & C. Todeschini, *The Medici Conspiracy* (New York: 2007), Chapter 7.

## Week 4

## Class Lecture

**Early Collections and Repatriation Issues: The Oriental Institute's Persian Collection**

**The Elgin Marbles**

## Reading:

"The Rise of the University Museum," Boston Review Article

K. F. Gibbon, "The Elgin Marbles: A Summary," in K. Fitz Gibbon (ed.), *Who Owns the Past?*, pp. 109 - 122.

## Look Over:

Text of the 1963 British Museum Act: <https://www.britishmuseum.org/PDF/BM1963Act.pdf>

**Case Study I:** Pair of Canosan kraters (returned to Italy in 2012 after Christie's auction)

**Reading for Case Study:** C. Tsirogiannis, "Something is Confidential in the State of Christie's," in the *Journal of Art Crime* 9, pp. 3 - 19.

**Case Study II:** Marble statue of a boy (Virginia Museum of Fine Arts)

**Reading for Case Study:** C. Tsirogiannis, "A Marble Statue of a Boy at the Virginia Museum of Fine Arts," in the *Journal of Art Crime* 9, pp. 55 - 60.

#### Class Lecture

##### Repatriation and the Universal Museum

###### Reading:

K. Singh, "Universal Museums: The View From Below," in L. V. Prott (ed.), *Witnesses to History: A Compendium of Documents and Writings on the Return of Cultural Objects* (2009), pp. 123 - 129.

J. Boardman, "'National' Heritage and Scholarship," in *Cultural Heritage Ethics*, pp. 131 - 134.

T. Flynn, "Fear of Cultural Objects," in *Cultural Heritage Ethics*, pp. 135 - 148.

###### Look Over:

Metropolitan Museum/Italy Repatriation Agreement

**Case Study I:** Marble statue of Vibia Sabina (returned to Italy from the MFA Boston)

**Reading for Case Study:** D. W. J. Gill and C. Chippindale, "From Boston to Rome: Reflections on Returning Antiquities," in *International Journal of Cultural Property* 13, pp. 311 - 331.

**Case Study II:** The 'Sevso Treasure'

**Reading for Case Study:** K. Fitz Gibbon (ed.), *Who Owns the Past?*, pp. 83 - 96, and <http://traffickingculture.org/encyclopedia/case-studies/sevso-treasure/>

#### Class Lecture

##### The Conventions and Laws

##### The 1970 UNESCO Convention and the 1995 UNIDROIT Convention

##### Bilateral Agreements

###### Reading:

K. F. Gibbon, "Chronology of Cultural Property Legislation" in K. Fitz Gibbon, *Who Owns the Past?*, pp. 3 - 8.

W. G. Pearlstein, "Cultural Property, Congress, the Courts, and Customs: The Decline and Fall of the Antiquities Market?" in K. Fitz Gibbon (ed.), *Who Owns the Past?*, pp. 9 - 32.

M. Papa Sokal, "The U.S. Legal Response to the Protection of the World Cultural Heritage," in N. Brodie et al. (eds.), *Archaeology, Cultural Heritage, and the Antiquities Trade* (Gainesville: 2006), pp. 36-67.

###### Look Over:

Text of the 1970 UNESCO Convention: UNESCO website ([www.unesco.org](http://www.unesco.org))

Text of the 1995 UNIDROIT Convention: UNIDROIT website ([www.unidroit.org](http://www.unidroit.org))

Text of the US-Italy Bilateral Agreement

UNESCO's World Heritage List at <http://whc.unesco.org/pg.cfm?cid=31>

Risk Map of Italian Cultural Heritage

C. Renfrew, *Loot, Legitimacy and Ownership* (London: 2006), Appendices 1 and 2

Object Loan Guidelines Italy-US

Link to List of Italian Cultural Heritage Legislation

#### Site Visit

##### The Living City I: Monuments of the Campus Martius and Piazza Venezia

Meeting Point: Outside in the Piazza dell' Orologio

End Point: Piazza Venezia

###### Reading:

D. Karmon, *The Ruin of the Eternal City*, Introduction and Chapter 1

B. W. Painter, Jr., *Mussolini's Rome*, Introduction and Chapter 1

**Monument Biographies:** Castel Sant'Angelo, Stadium of Domitian, Pantheon, Theater of Marcellus

## Week 5

### Class Lecture

Class Lecture: "National" Heritage? Italy's Cultural Entities  
Regulating the Market and Enforcement: Art and Antiquities Squads  
Historical Overview of Italy's Conservation Efforts  
The Current State of Affairs

### Look Over:

MIBACT, Roma Capitale, and Carabinieri TPC websites

### Reading:

M. de la Torre and M. MacLean, "The archaeological heritage in the Mediterranean region," in M. de la Torre (ed.), *The Conservation of Archaeological Sites in the Mediterranean Region*, pp. 5 - 92  
View UNESCO's World Heritage List at <http://whc.unesco.org/pg.cfm?cid=31>  
K. D. Vitelli and C. Colwell-Chanthaphonh, *Archaeological Ethics*, Chapters 13 - 16, and 21  
K. E. Meyer, *The Plundered Past*, Appendix B

### Site Visit

The Living City II: Monuments of the Ancient City Center (Including Forum of Nerva and The Roman Forum)  
Meeting and End Point: Entrance to the Roman Forum (Largo della Salara Vecchia 5/6)

### Reading

J. Pollini, "The Archaeology of Destruction: Christians, Images of Antiquity, and Some Problems of Interpretation" (Moodle)  
D. Karmon, *The Ruin of the Eternal City*, Chapters 2 and 3  
B. W. Painter, Jr., *Mussolini's Rome*, Chapter 2

**Monument Biographies:** The Arch of Septimius Severus, The Curia, The Temple of Antoninus and Faustina, The Arch of Titus, and Domitian's Palace

### Site Visit

FINAL PAPERS DUE

REVIEW FOR FINAL EXAM

The Living City III: Monuments of the Modern City Center (Including the Imperial Forums and Colosseum complex)

Meeting Point: The Column of Trajan

End Point: In front of the Arch of Constantine

### Reading

D. Karmon, *The Ruin of the Eternal City*, Conclusion  
E. Marlowe, *Shaking Ground*, excerpts (Moodle)

**Monument Biographies:** Markets of Trajan, Colosseum, Meta Sudans, & the Arch of Constantine

### FINAL EXAM